

Lost in Translation: The Italian Rendering of UNICEF ‘The State of the World’s Children 2004’ Report

1. The UNICEF 2004 Report

The text under analysis falls within the domain of socio-political document writing and translating in an international context. Let us first briefly refer to the state of translating activities within international organizations, which is not free of controversy.¹ On the one hand, there has been a considerable increase since World War II in the number of international organizations, either inter-governmental or non-governmental, which consider multi-culturalism a ‘politically correct’ and explicitly pursued goal. On the other hand, powerful language learning policies have made it possible to communicate via ‘international’ languages and numerous non-profit organizations, which tend to employ voluntary translators: the result is the almost exclusive use of English or French as international languages. These translation policies may not be very sensitive in respecting national or regional identities, but definitely help to reduce costs.

Even within the European Union, attempts to support greater use of national languages, against the all-pervasive spread of international English, have failed when faced with budgetary and organizational considerations. Moreover, the vast majority of translators’ and interpreters’ international organizations and their members are in the capitals of central Europe, a phenomenon which

* Lucia Abbamonte’s contributions: Sections 1, 2, 3; Flavia Cavaliere’s contributions: Sections 4, 5, 6.

1 Space restrictions do not allow a more extensive analysis of this complex topic; for a detailed investigation, see Pym (2001).

highlights once more the situation of economic and cultural disadvantage of developing countries, facilitating the pragmatic, but 'politically *in-correct*' tendency towards linguistic and bureaucratic centralization.

Such a 'translational/international' framework is the situational and textual context in which *The State of the World's Children* Report was produced in English, French and Spanish. The pivot text available at the official UNICEF site is in English and from the same site it is possible to access the French and Spanish versions – official languages of the United Nations – whereas the Italian version can only be retrieved from the Italian UNICEF site. Versions in other national languages – there are 37 national UNICEF Committees, the so-called Donor Countries – can be retrieved from their respective sites. The official English report is drafted annually by a team of writers on the basis of documents and data received from local UNICEF offices situated in different parts of the world.

The documents investigated here are the English text (Source Text) and the Italian translation (Target Text). A close reading of the English text reveals that it is not an informative, impersonal representation of data, an official statement of facts, but, instead, an ethically biased report – as not infrequently happens in the domains of socio-political and scientific communication. Discourse analysis has shown over the years that neutrality is not always to be expected in these fields. The parallel reading of the two texts, within the Applied Descriptive Translation Studies (ApDTS) framework,² has shown that in the documents under investigation many different types of strategies, both covert and overt, are at work.

The 2004 edition focuses on the importance of education for girls. According to the data reported, girls born and growing up in developing countries are still deprived even of primary education in too many cases. This is explained as the consequence of many factors, mainly the impossibility for poor families to meet the expenses, the unwillingness to renounce the girls' labour in the home and/or in

2 Cf. Ulrich / Bollettieri Bosinelli (1999). Although ApDTS cannot be described as a unified approach, it can be basically viewed as a dynamic interplay between theoretical models and practical case studies: it is mainly a descriptive, target-oriented, functional and systemic approach.

poorly paid jobs, and the distance and poor sanitation of the schools. Figures and testimonies (life-stories) show that girls, much more frequently than boys, are deprived of education when conditions are difficult. The impact on society as a whole is evaluated as devastating, not only for the girls themselves but for future generations as well: the children of mothers unaware of the most basic notions of hygiene and nutrition are likely to grow up less healthy, and the burden for the sanitary system is therefore heavier – not to mention the high infant mortality rate and the spread of HIV/AIDS.

Therefore, even though the declared communicative purpose is ‘to inform’, the ultimate aim is to attract the world’s attention to the urgent need for economic aid and political support. Indeed, emotion is an important feature of the language of the original English report, a quality, as we shall shortly illustrate, that is not fully shared by the Italian version, where a notably different stance-taking is recognizable.

In this chapter, we will examine two aspects of the issue: a) by analysing within White’s (2002) Appraisal Framework the different textual and lexical choices in the Source Text (ST) and the Target Text (TT), and b) by evaluating the hidden (and possibly ideological) assumptions of the many examples of implicitation and omissions in the TT.

2. Affective / epistemic positioning

The first most evident finding of this parallel reading is the co-existence of two planes of discourse, which can be defined, in Hunston / Thompson’s (2000) words, as an ‘autonomous plane’, where informational terms prevail, and an ‘interactive plane’, where the authorial bias is more manifest. These planes do not seem, however, to be evenly balanced: in our ST the interactive plane prevails, which means that the writer’s subjective comments and evaluative attitude to the subject matter are more explicit and apparent, while in the TT, where the autonomous plane is foremost,

informational terms and a more neutral attitude are the most frequent choices. The intentional, presentational and pragmatic use of language prevails in the English report whereas the Italian version sounds more informational and factual: for instance, when *made a most passionate commitment* and *embraces* become “si sono impegnati con convinzione” and “si è fatto carico”, respectively (see Table 1).

<i>AFFECTIVE</i>	<i>EPISTEMIC</i>
to jump-start development	Uno slancio per lo sviluppo
made a most passionate commitment	si sono impegnati con convinzione
embraces	si è fatto carico
being involved	collaborare
being denied	vengono privati
parents often do not realize	molti genitori ignorano
they are not likely to demand	difficilmente si sentono in grado di pretendere
they may find it difficult	possono non riuscire
ensuring that all girls are educated	il problema dell’istruzione femminile
ignores human rights	trascura i diritti umani
huge	assai gravoso
heartbreaking	sacrifici dolorosi
efforts	impegni
struggle desperately	combattere battaglie perse in partenza
girls lose out even more than boys	le bambine si trovano in una posizione più difficile rispetto ai maschi
poverty’s role	il problema della povertà
the cost is surmountable	i costi non sono un problema insormontabile
it is not enough to allocate financial resources	può essere inutile destinare risorse finanziarie

Table 1. Affective / epistemic positioning.

Further, it is not always easy to distinguish between the attitudinal/affective and evaluative meanings (in White’s terms) and the objective/epistemic ones. To this purpose the Appraisal Framework offers useful tools to explore, describe, and select examples from the two texts, which highlight significant differences in the respective lexico-grammatical choices and modes of textuality. Applying the features of the Appraisal Framework, we aim firstly to investigate the ways language is used to evaluate situations and to adopt stances; and

secondly, to analyse how attitudes, judgements and emotive responses are explicitly presented in texts, or implied, presupposed, assumed. In particular, we attempt to highlight how the different ST and TT uses of evaluative language create different authorial voices and how rhetorical strategies in the English version convey underlying values and beliefs which shape the entire document; such values, however, seem to fade and lose significance in the Italian version.

Attitude can be conveyed in various ways, some of which are easily identifiable, while others call for a more careful scrutiny. In some cases, the choice of particular words or phrases overtly states the writer's stance, but, generally, the situation is far more complex. Attitude is often conveyed not by single words (though individual words can be attitudinal) but by phrases and sentences, and, above all, by the interaction of diverse elements of statements which transmit the writers' propositions and points of view, and, therefore, need to be analysed as a whole.

Depending on its more or less immediate 'readability', attitude can be implicitly conveyed, rather than explicitly indicated. Explicit attitude is expressed by overt evaluative words, phrases or sentences, that is to say utterances which straightforwardly communicate a positive or negative sense. As for implicit attitude, on the contrary, it is not easy to detect instances of evaluative/attitudinal expressions, as, for example, in these utterances from our ST: *for an inconceivable 100 years*; becomes "per cento anni ancora", and *sabotage* and *is enormous* are rendered as "ostacolano" and "possono essere molto ampie", respectively. In such cases, it is the reader's particular sets of beliefs and expectations which will lead him to interpret the writing as true or untrue, acceptable or unacceptable, appealing or unattractive, and so forth. The same word or phrase can assume positive or negative value depending on the reader's point of view.

Evaluative language can be expressed by two primary modes: dialogistic and attitudinal, the latter being prominent in our ST.³ In

3 Different features of attitude can be analysed: attitudinal positioning can be emotional, ethical or aesthetic. This leads to three main subtypes: *Affect* – which concerns emotion and shows the writer's emotional commitment to the state of events described; *Judgement* – which refers to positive or negative evaluation of human behaviour by reference to sets of rules and social norms; *Appreciation* – which relates to those evaluations which are concerned with

light of the strong ethical implications of the content of the ST and TT, Affect and Judgement are the only categories we take into consideration in our textual analysis, with particular reference to affective evaluation. As seen, it is precisely this category which allows us to trace the two writers' different commitments. Affectual positioning in our ST is mainly indicated:

- by verbs of emotion which indicate mental or physical processes, or verbs which metaphorically convey sympathetic commitment such as *to embrace, to grip, to sabotage, to struggle, to jump-start*;
- by adverbs which specify circumstances of manner, such as *desperately, unduly, widely, stubbornly, solitary, child-friendly*;
- by adjectives of emotion: *heartbreaking, crippling, overwhelming, surmountable, dire*;
- by nominalization: *failure of accountability, funding commitments, girls' lack of education, learning achievements, willingness to help, readiness to lead, nurturing work*.

A comparison of the previous and other examples from the ST and the corresponding *loci* in the TT will make the differences in the intensity of the affective positioning more evident, as Table 1 highlights; for example, *crippling poverty and multiplying misery that grip many areas of the globe* and *has embraced* become “la crescente povertà che affligge tanta parte del mondo” and “conduce”. All of the stretches reported in Table 1 deserve some specific comments, but this would be repetitive for the reader. It may be useful, however, to briefly refer to the most meaningful and authentic messages. An issue pertaining to the developed countries, which, in the ST, are expected to provide energy and *to jump-start development*, in the TT is left exclusively to the initiative of the poor by being transformed into “uno slancio per lo sviluppo”. The passionate commitment of the English version conveyed by phrases such as *made a most passionate commitment* becomes in the Italian version “si sono impegnati con convinzione”, where the physical intensity, and the political connotation of the ST lose strength. In the Italian text the authorial attitude towards the relationship between the peoples of the

positive and negative assessments of material objects, but also, in a wider sense, artefacts such as works of art.

developing countries and their problems sometimes sounds derogatory: *they may find it difficult* and *struggle desperately* are translated as “possono non riuscire” and “combattere battaglie perse in partenza”, thus questioning the abilities of these people to overcome their problems.

In addition, the English version points more clearly to our moral obligation – as rich countries – to take on responsibility towards the poor of the world. In the Italian translation, instead, such an obligation becomes a heavy burden, e.g.: *ensuring that all girls are educated* and *poverty's role* correspond to “il problema dell'istruzione femminile” and “il problema della povertà”. A surmountable, though serious, problem becomes too difficult to resolve, thus leading to a waste of energy and money: *it is not enough to allocate financial resources* is translated as “può essere inutile destinare risorse finanziarie”. Here the translational shift goes beyond a mere difference in evaluation: the whole meaning appears to be altered.

Furthermore, according to White's Appraisal Framework, commitment can be expressed by either endorsed or dis-endorsed utterances: in the former, the writer directly or indirectly supports or approves the statement; in the latter, he distances himself from the content by indicating disagreement or hinting at its unreliability.⁴ On the other hand, endorsed utterances are generally represented as factual, trustworthy and, as such, worthy of consideration. In the documents under analysis, the presentation of data and quotations of public officers and Ministers in the English version are referred to with more emphatic, committed phrases, whereas in the Italian version a more neutral, implicit mode is commonly used (e.g. *will need to win* becomes “dovrà fare opera di convincimento”). Endorsed utterances are sometimes completely omitted, as is the case in the following reporting and reported sentences: *In a closing statement, one of the Ministers echoed many of his colleagues when he declared: “We can do it! Let me tell you we are bringing the gender gap to zero by 2005”*.

4 This is generally achieved by quoting verbs such as *to claim* and *allege*. Another recurrent mechanism for expressing dis-endorsement more indirectly is to mark the utterance as unexpected or surprising. Dis-endorsement can, however, reach the point of absolute rejection or denial of the attributed proposition.

3. Lexical/semantic shifts in the translation process

3.1. Concrete vs abstract language

The most striking feature when comparing the original and the translated report is lexical diversity – i.e. a shift in perspective in the choice of words. Shifts of various kinds are inextricably linked with other translation decisions, and the expected result is an overall different functional effect. Shifts at micro level do not necessarily correspond to significant shifts at macro level in the global interpretation of the text, although some kind of cumulative effect is reached, as happens in our TT to a notable degree. The aim here is not to evaluate, but to emphasize how the main translational/semantic shift is from a more specific and concrete to a more general and abstract language. The language of the ST carries with it – though used as a *lingua franca* for international communication – connotations and semantic implications of the source linguistic and cultural system.

The lexical choices and often the use of tenses themselves in the ST are meant to convey the idea of required and/or achieved efficiency in the UNICEF initiatives and work. This, in turn, should stimulate a chain reaction response in the reader, urging him to be proactive and effective in offering a helping hand. In the TT, on the contrary, the tendency towards vagueness and the use of abstract terms create a kind of emotional gap between the text and the recipient, who is not as physically and empathically involved as the reader of the English version.

It is generally acknowledged that semantic/pragmatic values and the quasi-conventional meanings of lexical items and phrases are fully carried out only within their own co-text and context. Therefore the examples in Table 2 may result less effective because they are not cited in their original context.

CONCRETE	ABSTRACT
less healthy than they could be	la loro salute è precaria
eradicate	eliminare
Would follow	si potrebbe ottenere
is	sarà
framework of partnership	concetto di alleanza
backbone	alla base
to set up strategy to tackle underachievement by boys	elaborare programmi per migliorare l'apprendimento degli studenti maschi
stay on task	seguire il discorso
to prick the conscience of the comfortable	scuotere la coscienza dei più fortunati
bring home	messo in luce

Table 2. Concrete vs abstract language occurrences.

3.2. Visual/spatial language vs bureaucratese

Another function of lexical choices in the original text is to place the readers in the role of spectators, evoking their empathic participation in the described scene. ‘To make them see’ seems to be the main ST purpose. The most frequently used rhetorical tool to make words convey visual experiences in the ST is hypotyposis (cf. Eco 2003). It may function at the denotative level, e.g. *the availability of safe, accessible and girl-friendly schools*, and by the use of precise spatial descriptions: *the new school – a single classroom on the ground floor of a converted house*, or long, detailed lists of human participants or objects, e.g. *Along the dusty, rugged pathways that trickle across El-Geneina in West Darfur, an area of Sudan near the border with Chad, a slim, bright-eyed 11-year-old girl leads an impressive procession of three donkeys. The first is so overloaded with yellow grass that only its spindly legs and doleful eyes can be seen; the other two strain under their heavy cargoes of firewood and water*; or through accumulation of events and characters and/or objects, e.g. *with its wide streets and friendly faces, Kuninga is a pleasant village with a market selling fruit, grain and third-hand shoes. There are also school books and pens for sale[...]*. These represent marked and significant stylistic choices that are not always fully rendered in the TT. This intentional accumulative effect of examples with a clear rhetorical

finality must have been considered superfluous in the TT, and consequently they are often omitted.

At the lexical level we can often notice a shift from words evoking visual/spatial scenes to more vague, less referential and more bureaucratic language.⁵ *To accompany on the road*, for example, becomes “condurre verso”, and *girls left out of school* is replaced by “ragazze private del diritto all’istruzione”, or else, *for seeing the right to an education fulfilled* becomes “dare attuazione al diritto all’istruzione” (for more examples see Table 3).

<i>VISUAL/SENSORIAL LANGUAGE</i>	<i>BUREAUCRATESE</i>
all children are in school	istruzione universale
will need to win	dovrà fare opera di convincimento
to accompany on the road	condurre verso
impact	prezzo
girls left out of school	ragazze private del diritto all’istruzione
is child rights in action	e’ un esempio concreto di come dare attuazione ai diritti del bambino
for seeing the right to an education fulfilled	dare attuazione al diritto all’istruzione
action	impegni
to attract and retain girls and boys in school	permettere ai giovani di proseguire gli studi
create	avvicinare
fewer children will die	la mortalità infantile diminuisce
rooted in the belief	associato
flawed	priva di validità
has followed a slow path to the realization	si è arrivati tardi
push for girls’ education	trasformano il tema dell’istruzione femminile
their feelings are right on target	si tratta di considerazioni fondate
flooded	invase
in the same vein	analogamente
have been shown to work on the ground	già sperimentate con successo altrove
now being brought into the light	solo oggi si comincia a discutere
sieged	attacco
have set a seal on	hanno convalidato

5 This is in line with Italian political discourse, which shows a tendency towards a more bureaucratic style.

girls drop out	la dispersione scolastica femminile
the rhythm of schooling	l'abitudine alla scuola
to recognize and respond	prendere misure in merito
schools for the hard to reach	frequentare lezioni ai più svantaggiati
reach out to children's individual needs	rispondere alle esigenze del singolo individuo
in order to get more girls into school	per migliorare l'istruzione femminile
boys are not being reached	sono in prevalenza i maschi a restare esclusi
clear goals	finalità principali
get them into school	introducendoli e mantenendoli nel sistema scolastico
starved	private
must take practical steps	devono prendere misure concrete
we cannot walk any deeper	non possiamo progredire
poor provinces	province dotate di scarsi mezzi

Table 3. Visual vs bureaucratese language occurrences.

The quality of the native text language is considerably nearer to the physical space used as a recognizable referent, for example, when *in the same vein* becomes “analogamente”. This seems to indicate a stronger belief in the capacity for action, and, more important, for efficacy, as compared to the TT translational choices. Let us illustrate this point with the following examples: *make change* and *action* in ST are rendered as “intervenire” and “impegni” in the Italian version. This translational shift shows a different stance-taking at work.

Here we are not referring to the commonly used translation strategies required by the transition from a cultural/linguistic system to another, such as for example, instances of substitution (i.e. “materie umanistiche” for *language-based subjects*, or “sedi locali” for *clubs and chapters*). What is at stake is rather the transitivity of language which signifies faith in the efficacy of political intervention: the native text moves on a much more interactive discourse plane than the Italian version, where *create* rather than “avvicinare” is the goal. The bureaucratic, less visual Italian stylistic choices appear to mask a more distant attitude.

4. From explicitation / implicitation to paraphrases and omissions

4.1. *Explicitation / implicitation*

One of the most striking features emerging from the parallel reading of the two texts is the impression that the Italian translation of the report differs in a kind of norm-disconfirming way from the original text, as is shown below in the discussion on the explicitation / implicitation ratio at discourse level. The easiest way to illustrate the explicitation / implicitation ratio is to start with explicitation (cf. Blum-Kulka 2001). Contrary to the generally shared notion that a tendency to explicitation in translated texts is a translation universal, the situation in the texts under analysis is remarkably different. We are not concerned so much about the explicitation required by different language systems but rather about explicitation as a feature of translation itself ('asymmetric explicitation'). More precisely the emphasis is on the influence of the communicative context on linguistic choices and significance. Some further general considerations on explicitation are necessary, before focusing on the texts.

Firstly, meaning obviously does not belong to a universal, univocal and stable category that can be simply made explicit or implicit. The translator therefore tends to act as a mediator, a link between the two parts, facilitating the communication as much as possible at a systemic level by coping with the constraints of the two languages involved, and at a cultural level as well. By and large, the whole process appears to be an act of interpretation/explanation performed by the translator, according to his skills and the criteria adopted. Meaning can and has to be modulated in different socio-cultural contexts, and translators can sometimes go beyond what is generally called the literalist approach if this promotes better comprehension. Other modes of explicating are clearly formulated by Klaudy and Károly (2005: 16, italics added):

Explicitation takes place, for example, when a SL [...] unit of a more general meaning is replaced by a TL [...] unit of a more special meaning; the complex meaning of a SL word is distributed over several words in the TL; new

meaningful elements appear in the TL text; one sentence in the SL is divided into two or several sentences in the TL; or, when SL phrases are extended or 'elevated' into clauses in the TL, etc. *Implication* occurs, for instance, when a *SL unit of a more specific meaning is replaced by a TL unit of a more general meaning*; translators draw together the meaning of several words, and thus SL units consisting of two or more words are replaced by a TL unit consisting of one word; meaningful lexical elements of the SL text are dropped; two or more sentences in the SL are conjoined into one sentence in the TL; or, when SL clauses are reduced to phrases in the TL, etc.

The implication process, as described above, is far more frequently recognizable than explicitation in the Italian translation of the 2004 UNICEF Report. The reasons for this are a matter for discussion, especially when the examples of implication are not justifiable in systemic terms. The TT we are dealing with seems to contradict the general tendency to explicitation, which is definitely more common than implication in translated texts. The choice whether to explicitate or not can be determined by various factors: the degree of freedom allowed to the translator and the translator's experience or lack of it (Levy 1965; Blum-Kulka 2001). A certain amount of redundancy (i.e. the epiphenomenon of explicitation) is necessary to master cross-cultural diversity, thus enhancing understanding at a deeper level. Translators are perfectly aware of the difficulties encountered in the processes of reading and constructing meaning. Different 'contexts of situation' require more explicit communicative strategies. In other words, translation is not only a matter of processing linguistic information, but also entails taking account of a number of other factors underlying textual statements, some of which may include dissimilar features of the socio-political system and cultural background of the particular country.

As far as our UNICEF texts are concerned, implication seems to prevail over explicitation. Such a situation may occur for different reasons. As Puurtinen (2003: 53) states, implication can be caused by "insufficient skills and knowledge rather than ideological motivations". In our case, however, examples of implication range from the omission of single words to the summing up of whole paragraphs in a few lines or even just a few words, not to mention the omission of entire paragraphs. In light of this it is not always easy to leave out ideological motivation.

Let us now illustrate our points with examples from the tables below. Table 4 contains the few examples of explicitation in the texts. Although they are classifiable as such, they do not particularly clarify or amplify the meaning. Instead of conveying or adding any sympathetic involvement, they translate meaning in a more detached language, for instance, when the adjective *poor* becomes “dotati di scarsi mezzi”, or the phrase *a violence-free school environment* is translated as “un ambiente scolastico tutelato dalla violenza”.

<i>EXPLICITATION</i>	
ST	TT
unrecorded	normalmente passa sotto silenzio
are gender-blind	non considerano l'approccio di genere
in the absence of a vaccine against HIV/AIDS, education is society's best defence against the disease.	fino a quando non si troverà un vaccino per HIV/AIDS, l'arma migliore che le società hanno a disposizione per difendersi dalla malattia rimane l'istruzione.
ultimately children will only be free from child labour, trafficking and sexual exploitation when:	in ultima analisi per liberare l'infanzia dal lavoro minorile, dal commercio dei bambini e dallo sfruttamento sessuale, è necessario che si verifichino le seguenti condizioni:
connected with their traditional socialization as males.	correlata con gli schemi di socializzazione maschile che hanno avuto modo di sperimentare
the gender balance of teachers	il rapporto numerico tra insegnanti maschili e femminili
their traditional socialization as males	gli schemi di socializzazione maschile che hanno avuto modo di sperimentare
girls' schooling can and should be promoted by actions such as:	tra le misure che si sono dimostrate capaci di promuovere l'istruzione femminile citiamo le seguenti:

Table 4. Occurrences of explicitation.

Far stronger is the impact of the numerous instances of implicitation, which is multifaceted in the TT, including paraphrases and omissions. Table 5 contains selective examples from the text that can be classified as pure implicitation. Implicitation in these examples works by moving from a more specific to a more general meaning, as in the case of *behaviour and attitudes* replaced by “scelte”, and *being*

constructive with both support and advocacy for change when needed by “offrendo critiche costruttive”, or *a unique positive force* replaced by “un’occasione unica”, and *the fruits of economic growth* by “la crescita economica”. Predictably enough, the deleted items have positive connotations and belong to the semantic area of support and enhancement.

<i>IMPLICITATION</i>	
ST	TT
child trafficking	traffico
the price of losing	perdere
experiential knowledge that will accompany the governments through the difficult tasks of facilitating education as a human right	bagaglio di conoscenze al quale far ricorso nel difficile compito di attuare il diritto all’istruzione
literacy and language skills gained by girls	l’alfabetizzazione delle bambine
every parent knows this to be true	tutti i genitori lo sanno
how the status of women relative to men affected their participation	come la condizione femminile potesse influenzare il contributo delle donne
move closer	più vicini
ensuring children the best start in life	il miglior inizio possibile
work as volunteers who care for, entertain and help educate pre-school-age children	lavorano come volontarie per l’educazione dei bambini in età prescolare
children affected by HIV/AIDS	i bambini e l’HIV/AIDS

Table 5. Occurrences of implicitation.

These examples have been included to highlight the pragmatic move at work from a more interactive to a more autonomous plane of discourse. This supports the hypothesis of the norm-disconfirming value of our TT, which, to refer to a quantitative datum, is 143 pages long, i.e. 5 pages shorter than the ST!

4.2. Paraphrases

Implicitation occurs also when paraphrases are used to combine two or more sentences, resulting in an undeniable loss of empathy. For example, whereas the ST conveys a manifest emotional attitude to

poor women and their hardship, the TT adopts a strikingly different perspective, as can be seen in the first example in Table 6.

<i>PARAPHRASES</i>	
ST	TT
these cuts hit poor women particularly hard since they had to step up their workload both inside and outside the home so that their families could cope.	colpendo in particolare le donne, che per far sopravvivere la famiglia dovevano addossarsi un maggior carico di lavoro, sia in casa che fuori.
this failure to reduce the overall number of children who do not attend school is worrying enough – especially bearing in mind the hazards, from exploitative child labour to HIV/AIDS, to which these out-of-school children are disproportionately exposed – but the global figure hides an even more disturbing truth at the regional level.	e queste cifre nascondono situazioni ben più gravi se si considerano determinate aree del mondo.
If the spirit of the Millennium Declaration and the targets of the Millennium Development Goals are to be met – and the education goals are only one part of the picture – it is clear that governments in developing countries will have to bear the lion’s share of the responsibility.	Appare evidente che i governi dei paesi in via di sviluppo dovranno assumersi la loro fetta di responsabilità, che è senza dubbio la maggiore.
but the evidence presented in this report demonstrates that the challenge of education for every girl is a challenge to developments in all its sectors:	tutti sono chiamati in causa:

Table 6. Examples of paraphrases.

4.3. Omissions

The climax of the implicitation process in our TT is represented by an extreme form of replacement, which could be labelled as ‘Zero Degree Substitution’, and ranges from single words to impressively large stretches of text (150 words). Although there is no loss of essential information nor data, and the main communicative aim of the report textual genre is respected, the undeclared but perhaps main communicative purpose of the ST – advocacy for political and economic support – is however partially lost. The connotative function

of the ST is tremendously reduced in the TT; it is therefore at the pragmatic level that the change is more consistent, as can be noticed in Table 7.⁶

What makes these omissions difficult to classify is their lack of homogeneity. In addition to contextual / historical and intra-textual references and information (underlined in the table), the omissions also include comments of diverse nature, the most frequent of which are value-indicating (in bold) and epistemic/evidential (in italics). However, it often occurs that pieces of information are omitted without causing serious loss at the informational level. It is not easy to distinguish between the functions and communicative purposes of the different omissions, as a result of which a certain amount of overlapping and intersection cannot be avoided. Nearly all omissions are affect-connoted; references and information cannot be clearly distinguished from the epistemic dimension. The choice has been made on the basis of what appears to be their foremost quality.

ST (OMITTED IN TT)
No other policy [i.e. to educate a girl] is as powerful in increasing the chances of education for the next generation.
...girls continue to systematically lose out on the benefits that an education affords.
<u>The events of 11 September 2001 and the battle against terrorism around the globe have occupied much of the world's headline attention and soaked up resources that could have been devoted to human development.</u>
Millions of children under five will continue to die needlessly over the same time.
<i>Despite these commitments, the ideal of universal education remains unfulfilled and gender gaps persist until today.</i>
And scores of countries are without the talent, energy and creativity these millions of children could bring to the development of their societies.
Education will open up the world to her.
<i>Using different methods – enrolment and attendance – helps get closer to the real number of children who might be denied their right to an education, and so in need of our intervention.</i>
<u>And because of the persistent and often subtle gender discrimination that runs through most societies, it is girls who are sacrificed first, being the last enrolled and first withdrawn from schools when times get tough.</u>

6 Although our analysis was both quantitative and qualitative, only a selection of meaningful examples is reported in the table due to space restrictions.

<p>The effort is morally imperative; it must also be practical and it must be catalytic.</p>
<p><i>The international community has committed itself, time and again, to fulfilling the education rights of girls as well as boys. The research community has demonstrated, in study after study, the social value of providing girls with an education.</i></p>
<p>There is no acceptable excuse for denying her the opportunities to develop to her fullest potential. Education saves and improves the lives of girls and women.</p>
<p>If they miss out on this, they inevitably miss out on secondary education and all the <u>good that goes with it.</u></p>
<p>[Education has an impact on areas beyond learning], extending a positive influence into most aspects of a child’s life.</p>
<p>In some powerful quarters there will still be overt discrimination and determined resistance to the idea of giving girls an equal chance. Many politicians, administrators or aid officials who pay lip service to the principles of gender equality remain uncomfortable with programmes that have a specific gender focus, and passively fail to implement them.</p>
<p><u>‘All’ implies that girls and boys must be equally well provided for.</u></p>
<p>This highlights the need for urgent, targeted action.</p>
<p><i>In many cases, countries might show no enrolment gap between boys and girls but a serious gap in learning achievements, reflecting a difference in the quality of education received by girls and boys.</i></p>
<p><u>These countries are ready for the societal transformation to help them make the leap and to further advance girls’ participation in society.</u></p>
<p><u>... and how girls’ education can drive the international efforts to achieve the Millennium Development Goals. Girls’ education is the most effective means of combating many of the most profound challenges to human development. [...] contributing stability to the lives of girls and boys and helping families to heal and look forward. For communities, the strategies for providing girls with the opportunities to complete their education yield benefits for all.</u></p>
<p>Efforts to protect children from violence and abuse will also ensure sound early cognitive development.</p>
<p><i>... and those who are in school spend less time in risky situations. And girls, who have traditionally had less access to the benefits of education, have an even greater need than boys for the protection that education can provide.</i></p>
<p><u>The fight against HIV/AIDS then – just like that for girls’ education – is multifaceted, and progress on one front cannot be divorced from progress on another.</u></p>
<p><u>Schools now being targeted have reported a decline in the number of pregnancies and dropouts. After families, education is the next perimeter of a protective environment for children. Schools can be a powerful protective force in most children’s lives, especially for girls and others who are highly vulnerable. This is not only because schools physically remove children from potential harm for much of the day but also because they help children learn skills and gather information so</u></p>

that they can protect themselves.
[Education] should be given priority and started as soon as possible.
...since the school playground can be a brutal place in which physical weakness is exploited and outsiders can be victimized and bullied. With this in mind, making schools safe is a cause pursued as passionately on behalf of boys as of girls.
<u>A study by the Jamaican Government showed that gender differences in achievement can be attributed to a range of factors from socialization by parents in early childhood through to gender-biased messages in society as a whole, and also to the fact that boys and girls were treated differently in the classroom.</u>
<i>A few years ago, it became evident that the boys were having trouble distinguishing love from sexual desire, so a curriculum unit was added on 'men's responsibility in sexual relationships, love and marriage'.</i>

Table 7. Examples of clause and sentence omissions.

The deletions could be due, as mentioned above, to the degree of freedom allowed to the translator and to his experience or lack of it. However, the undeniable level of translational expertise of our TT translator eliminates the 'inexperienced translator hypothesis'. At this point specific extra-textual pressures during the production of the translation must be considered. The translator of the Italian version did not work completely independently: his work was supervised and edited before publication. This may account for the trend towards conciseness – space constraints being one of the limitations that influence editing practice in the Italian UNICEF Drafting Team.⁷ Since there is interaction between the translator and the editor, it is not always possible to identify their individual contributions. Therefore, only the final product – the Italian TT in its situational context – can be evaluated.

In light of the ideological bias of the omitted parts (which are among the most committed and enthusiasm-raising textual stretches), the hypothesis of political intentions is not easily dismissible, though inconceivable and above all incompatible with UNICEF's institutional aims. More logical and convincing is the explanation of a purpose-driven approach to the act of translating/editing: the authenticity of the text has been altered to convey its meaning more effectively in

7 This was confirmed by an interview with one of the editors in charge of the Italian UNICEF Drafting Team.

accordance with Italian language usage. The resulting ‘deviance’ of the text is evident if the ST pragmatic aspects are considered: an empathic message becomes more informational, partly betraying the more authentic purpose of the native text.

An alternative hypothesis could be that the translator opted for a reader-oriented interpretative path, negotiating with his potential recipients a ‘refracted’ text, nearer to what he might have imagined to be their expectations. He may have aimed at a version which would be more readily ‘felt’ and stylistically appreciated by a public belonging to a more restricted geographical area and no longer identifiable with a given Anglo-Saxon linguistic system. The Italian ‘context of the situation’ is obviously different from that of authors working nearer to the heart of UNICEF, who are perhaps more directly involved with the situations described in the reports; their drafting of the texts reflects this unity of ‘text and context’, to borrow Halliday and Hasan’s (1985) words, which is somehow reduced in the Italian version.

From another perspective, we may also contemplate the possibility that our translator has been conditioned by the tendency towards institutional and bureaucratic language. Translators used to working for international organizations, in an institutionally-oriented framework, may consider mainly their colleagues and the institutions themselves as receivers, rather than the common readers outside the organization. There is no denying the powerful drives towards linguistic and bureaucratic centralization, which certainly do not encourage the adoption of variety and richness of linguistic registers when translating. The result is, as in our case, a type of ‘sanitised’ or ‘refracted’ text, i.e. a text which has been modified in order to become more ‘palatable’ to the expected recipients.

5. Commitment vs distancing

This distance between the ST and TT planes of discourse can be described by using many different approaches or categories. The more general and comprehensive perspective, however, may be to consider

the variation in the degree of commitment to the topic exhibited in the two texts. The authorial voice in the ST indicates agreement, support, engagement, endorsement and involvement towards the topic. Underlying the English author's single sentences and discourse-construction mode, a well-defined and action-oriented system of values is at work. The more evident pragmatic purpose is to effectively address the belief systems of the intended audiences – that is, the rich countries. The ST teleological implicatures are finalised to involve the reader in ethical and charity enterprises, and solidarity is textually conveyed by means of particular lexico-grammatical and discourse choices, which, as seen above, are often substituted, or even omitted in the TT. In the Italian version a certain degree of 'distancing' is usually felt and, in a way, the social meaning and ideological implications of the English version seem to have been altered, as we have highlighted by comparing the corresponding parts of the ST and the TT.

This shift of attitude can also be explained in terms of the general ethics of translation, which include all communicative genres, from fictional to documents and reports (Gouanvic 2001). If we agree that ethics is to be situated in the preservation of the significance of translated texts, compared with the significance of their source texts, this implies that its fundamental needs are the construction or the careful recognition of potential homologies between the two language communities involved.

The scope of the UNICEF reports, however, is much wider, virtually unlimited, since the reports are written in a trans-national context and addressed to a global audience. Their communicative purpose is to appeal to and, in a way, to identify or, even create, a world-wide discourse community that should be able to recognize as common and universal the local (though all-important), situated needs of the developing countries. Not *us* as opposed to *them* but a holistic *we*. The distancing move of the Italian version, on the contrary, is conducive to a type of re-setting of the perspective: *their* needs, *our* intervention – a yawning gap, difficult to bridge. The TT stylistic choices seem to build up a kind of compensation area where information is exchanged rather than commitment negotiated.

6. Concluding remarks

Our analysis, which has included aspects of both what is ‘in’ and what is ‘of’ the texts,⁸ has highlighted how the expected language of the report – a neutral statement of facts – is not characteristic of our State of the World’s Children 2004 Report. On the contrary, we can observe many different types of strategies, both covert and overt, that witness the authors’ undeniable involvement and their (un)conscious attempts to influence and enhance the reader’s response. Neutrality is denied on the ground by targeted options which, ranging from lexicogrammatical and textual choices up to discursal ones, contribute altogether to ideologically and socially connotate the text and bias the recipient. In our analysis White’s Appraisal Framework and the current results of explicitation / implicitation research have proved to be useful tools to identify the different ideological perspectives of the source and the target cultures. What in the ST are involving denunciations in the TT often sound like bare statements of unavoidable facts, perhaps to offer the addressee (a donor country) a ‘domesticated’ text. Dynamic differences in authorial stance towards the topic of the report discourse are manifest – commitment and distancing being the main categories for ST and TT respectively.

From a discourse-internal perspective we have seen how, in the native text discourse, pragmatic value is oriented towards mediating between the needs of poor developing countries and the distant attitude of the rich countries, and also towards ‘changing the minds’ of the privileged recipients in order to obtain substantial assistance. From the same perspective, socio-cultural mediation in the translated text discourse appears to be mainly referential up to the point of evoking an alterity dimension, where the emotional relevance of the report topics fades in the inter-discursive systems of bureaucratic language.

8 More recently, Hatim (1999) has argued that the important distinction between what is ‘in’ and what is ‘of’ the text has been ignored in translation studies to date. ‘In’ refers to the language itself, which can be analysed by text analysis, while ‘of’ refers to the text in its entirety, its overall effect in terms of ideology.

As regards the discourse external perspective or, more specifically, the inter-textual perspective of ST/TT observation, what appears to be undermined is the expected shared focus of attention on the report's contextualized meanings. The dimension of alterity is more coherently visible here: differences in perspective are undeniable as they are not conditioned so much by different linguistic systems as by partly discrepant beliefs and attitudes regarding the major motivational and emotional relevancies.

References

- Blum-Kulka, Shoshana 2001. Shifts of Cohesion and Coherence in Translation. In House, Juliane / Blum-Kulka, Shoshana (eds) *Interlingual and Intercultural Communication. Discourse and Cognition in Translation and Second Language Acquisition*. Tübingen: Narr, 17-35.
- Eco, Umberto 2003 *Dire quasi la stessa cosa. Esperienze di traduzione*. Milano: Bompiani.
- Gouanvic, Jean Marc 2001. Ethos, Ethics and Translation: Toward a Community of Destinies. In Pym, Anthony (ed.) *Return to Ethics*, special issue of *The Translator* 7/2, 129-38.
- Halliday, Michael A. / Hasan, Ruqaiya 1985. *Language, Context and Text. Aspects of Language in a Social-Semiotic Perspective*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Hatim, Basil 1999. The Cultural and the Textual in the Way Translation Studies has Evolved. Paper presented at the Centre of Language and Linguistics, University of Salford.
- Hunston, Susan / Thompson Geoff (eds) 2000. *Evaluation in Text: Authorial Stance and the Construction of Discourse*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Klaudy, Kinga / Karoly, Kristina 2005. Implication in Translation: Empirical Evidence for Operational Asymmetry in Translation. *Across Languages and Cultures* 6/1, 13-28.

- Levy, Jiri 1965. Will Translation Theory be of any Use to Translators? In Italiandeer, Rolf (ed.) *Übersetzen Vorträge und Beiträge von Internationalen Kongress literarischer Übersetzer in Hamburg 1965*. Frankfurt am Main: Athenäum, 72-82.
- Pym, Anthony 2001. The Use of Translation in International Organizations. <<http://www.fut.es/~apym/on-line/transinst.html>>
- Puurtinen, Tiina 2003. Explicitating and Implicitating Source Text Ideology. *Across Languages and Cultures* 14/2, 53-62.
- Ulrych, Margherita / Bollettieri Bosinelli, Rosa Maria 1999. The State of the Art in Translation Studies. An Overview. *Textus* 12/1, 219-42.
- White, Peter R. 2002. Appraisal: the Language of Attitudinal Evaluation and Intersubjective Stance. <<http://www.grammatics.com/appraisal>>.